

Department of Planning and Zoning

149 Church Street, City Hall
Burlington, VT 05401
www.burlingtonvt.gov/pz
Phone: (802) 865-7188
Fax: (802) 865-7195

David White, AICP, Director
Meagan Tuttle, Comprehensive Planner
Jay Appleton, Senior GIS/IT Programmer/Analyst
Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Interim Chief Administrative Officer
Mary O'Neil, AICP, Senior Planner
Ryan Morrison, CFM, Associate Planner
Layne Darfler, Planning Technician
Anita Wade, Zoning Clerk



MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Ryan Morrison, CFM, Associate Planner
RE: 19 Kingsland Terrace, ZP18-0221CA
Date: September 12, 2017

File: ZP18-0221CA

Location: 19 Kingsland Terrace

Zone: RL **Ward:** 6S

Date application accepted: August 24, 2017

Applicant/ Owner: Malina Kim & Brian Corcoran

Request: Replace wooden garage doors with a custom sliding aluminum garage door, and replace the garage's asphalt shingle roof with a metal shingle roof. The garage (c. 1919) is listed in the South Union Street National Historic District. The project also includes the following, which is not subject to review under Sec. 5.4.8 CDO: expanding a master bedroom into the rear enclosed second story deck, installing a basement egress window, installing a patio and fence, and replacing the driveway.



Background:

- **Zoning Permit 07-191CA;** install 12 ft. wide French door in rear, close in upper seasonal porch and install two windows. Approved 10/3/06.

The programs and services of the City of Burlington are accessible to people with disabilities. For accessibility information call 865-7188 (for TTY users 865-7142).

- **Zoning Permit 07-749FC**; install aluminum rod fence and gate to enclose rear and side yards. Approved 6/8/07.
- **Zoning Permit 09-734CA**; add 17' x 10' deck (including stairs) and 3' x 3' stairs at rear of dwelling. Approved 5/4/09.
- **Non-Applicability of Zoning Permit 18-0209NA**; 1) replace garage foundation; 2) replace furnace; 3) augment or replace basement supports, replace basement stairs; 4) improve attic insulation in floor; 5) augment attic floor; 6) widen and deepen attic stairwell; 7) expand and move master closet; 8) convert one bedroom to office and master bathroom; 9) repair front porch.

Overview: The property owner proposes several alterations to the existing single family residence and garage. These alterations include replacing the wooden garage doors with a custom sliding aluminum garage door, replacing the garage's asphalt shingle roof with a metal shingle roof, expanding the master bedroom into the rear enclosed second story deck, installing a basement egress window, installing a patio and fence, and replacing the driveway. The garage (c. 1919) is listed in the South Union Street National Historic District, and the proposed changes to it are subject to Sec. 5.4.8 CDO

ARTICLE 5: HISTORIC BUILDINGS AND SITES

(a) Applicability

1. The building is 50 years old or older.

The garage at 19 Kingsland Terrace was constructed ca. 1919 and is more than 50 years old.

2. The building or site is deemed to possess significance in illustrating or interpreting the heritage of the city, state, or nation in history, architecture, archeology, technology, and culture because on or more of the following conditions is present:

A. Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history; or,

B. Association with the lives of persons significant in the past; or,

C. Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or representation of the work of a master, or possession of high artistic values, or representation of a significant or distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or,

D. Maintenance of an exceptionally high degree of integrity, original site orientation and virtually all character defining elements intact; or,

E. Yielding, or may be likely to yield, information important to prehistory.

The garage is a contributing resource on the National Register of Historic Places – South Union Street National Historic District. According to register entry, the garage is a 1-bay, clapboarded garage, topped by a gable roof. The doors are highly decorated, with 6 glass panels found in the top half and diagonal clapboards in the lower. Iron strap hinges are attached to the swinging doors at the corners.

According to the applicant, the garage has vinyl siding, and the roof is asphalt shingled. One of swinging doors is missing, and the other has significant rot.

3. *The building or site possess a high degree of integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.*

See item 2 above. The garage is visible from the public street. There is no history of zoning permits for any work done on the garage. As the applicant states, the siding is currently vinyl, not the clapboard siding as noted in the historic register listing. While the presence of vinyl siding today may play a role in future zoning permit requests to repair and/or replace it, it should not play a role in the discussion of the proposed garage door and single roof replacements.

(b) Standards and Guidelines

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*
The primary and accessory buildings at 19 Kingsland Terrace were constructed for residential use. There are no plans to change the use of the property.
2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
As the applicant states, the garage siding is now vinyl, instead of the clapboard siding noted in the historic listing. The wooden garage doors are original, however, in clear need of replacement. The applicant proposes to replace the garage doors with a custom sliding aluminum door that will have a similar, but not identical, appearance to the original doors. Additionally, the applicant proposes to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a metal shingle roof.
3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*
The applicant proposes a custom sliding aluminum garage door as a replacement to the existing wooden doors, and to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a metal shingle roof. These proposed changes represent changes to the historic materials and appearance of the garage. However, these replacements appear to simulate the appearance of the original materials. This is basis of the DAB review: to see if the proposed replacements maintain the historic integrity of the garage.
4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*
There appear to be no changes to the garage that have acquired historic significance.
5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
The crux of this review is to determine whether or not the DAB will consider allowing the replacement garage doors to be of an aluminum material and similar appearance, and for the asphalt shingle roof to be replaced with a metal shingle roof.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*
The applicant proposes replacing the deteriorated garage doors with a custom sliding aluminum garage door that, while not identical, will maintain a similar appearance to the original wooden doors.
7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*
No such treatment is included in this proposal.
8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*
There are no known archeological resources on the property.
9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*
The basis of DAB review of the proposal is to determine whether or not it will support the request to replace the deteriorated wood garage doors with a custom sliding aluminum garage door. While the door material will change, the applicant is clearly making an effort to maintain the appearance of the existing garage doors.
10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
There are no additions proposed.

ARTICLE 6: DEVELOPMENT REVIEW STANDARDS

Part 1: Land Division Design Standards

Not applicable.

Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards

Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards

(a) Protection of important natural features

There are no important natural features on the subject property. Existing green space amounts to lawn and garden areas.

(b) Topographical alterations

The property is essentially flat and will remain so. No topographical alterations are proposed.

(c) Protection of important public views

The subject property is not affected by any identified public view corridor.

(d) Protection of important cultural resources

The garage, constructed c. 1919, is listed on the South Union Street National Historic District. See Sec. 5.4.8 above.

(e) Supporting the use of alternative energy

No part of this application would prevent the use of wind, solar, water, or other alternative energy device.

(f) Brownfield sites

The subject property is not an identified brownfield.

(g) Provide for nature's events

There are no site changes proposed.

(h) Building location and orientation

No changes to the garage's location and/or orientation are proposed.

(i) Vehicular access

No changes to the existing vehicular access are proposed.

(j) Pedestrian access

No changes to the existing pedestrian access are proposed.

(k) Accessibility for the handicapped

None is required for single family uses; however encouraged.

(l) Parking and circulation

No changes to the current parking situation are proposed or required.

(m) Landscaping and fences

No new landscaping is proposed.

(n) Public plazas and open space

No public plaza or open space is included or required in this proposal.

(o) Outdoor lighting

There are no new outdoor lighting fixtures proposed.

(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design

The applicant has not identified changes that would require additional utilities or mechanical units.

Part 3, Architectural Design Standards

Sec. 6.3.2, Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment

1. Massing, Height, and Scale

There will be no changes to the garage's existing massing, height and scale.

2. Roofs and Rooflines

No change to the garage's roof/roofline will occur as a result of the proposal.

3. Building Openings

The existing 2-door garage door is proposed to be replaced with a single sliding garage door, custom built to replicate the appearance of the original 2-door garage door. Building openings will not change.

(b) Protection of important architectural resources

See Sec. 5.4.8.

(c) Protection of important public views

Not applicable.

(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge

Nothing in this proposal will take away from the property's inviting street edge.

(e) Quality of materials

The current garage doors are made of wood. The applicant proposes to replace the missing/rotten wooden garage doors with an aluminum sliding garage door. While not true to the existing door material, an aluminum door will certainly maintain its integrity for decades.

(f) Reduce energy utilization

Because there is no habitable space in the garage, it is not subject to the city's energy efficiency standards.

(g) Make advertising features complimentary to the site

No advertising is included in this proposal.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design

There is no proposal to add meters, mechanical units, etc.

(i) Make spaces safe and secure

The garage currently has exterior motion-detected lighting on the front and side façade. No new lighting is proposed.

REQUESTED ACTION:

Staff requests that the Design Advisory Board determine whether or not it will support the existing wooden garage doors to be replaced with a single, custom built aluminum sliding door that takes on the appearance of the existing doors.